

Practicing Inference Rules

1. Each of the following little derivation has a mistake. What is it?

(a) 1. p $\vdash q$ A

.....

(b) 1. Γ $\vdash p \vee q$ premise

2. Γ $\vdash q$ 1, \vee E

.....

(c) 1. p $\vdash p$ A

2. q $\vdash q$ A

3. $p \wedge q$ $\vdash p \wedge q$ 1,2, \wedge I

.....

(d) 1. Γ, s $\vdash r$ premise

2. Γ, q $\vdash p$ premise

3. Γ, s, q $\vdash r \supset p$ 1,2, \wedge I

.....

(e) 1. s $\vdash s$ A

2. $s \vee w$ $\vdash s$ 1, \vee I

.....

(f) 1. $p \wedge q$ $\vdash p \wedge q$ A

2. p $\vdash p \wedge q$ 1, \wedge E

.....

(g) 1. r $\vdash s \vee w$ premise

2. r $\vdash s \vee (w \vee q)$ 1, \vee I

.....

(h) 1. Γ, q $\vdash p$ premise

- 2. Δ $\vdash \neg p$ premise
- 3. Γ, Δ $\vdash \neg q$ 1,2, \neg I

.....

- (i) 1. Γ $\vdash w$ premise
- 2. Γ $\vdash \neg\neg w$ 1, \neg I

.....

- (j) 1. Δ $\vdash \neg\neg p \vee r$ premise
- 2. Δ $\vdash p \vee r$ 1, \neg E

.....

- (k) 1. $p \supset q$ $\vdash p \supset q$ A
- 2. q $\vdash q$ A
- 3. $p \supset q, q$ $\vdash p$ 1,2, \supset E

.....

- (l) 1. $p \supset q$ $\vdash p \supset q$ A
- 2. $p \supset q$ $\vdash p$ 1, \supset E

.....

- (m) 1. Γ $\vdash a$ premise
- 2. Δ $\vdash b$ premise
- 3. Γ, Δ $\vdash a \supset b$ 1,2, \supset I

.....

2. Fill in missing items.

- (i) 1. $\underline{\quad}$ \vdash $\underline{\quad}$ A
 2. $p \supset q, r$ \vdash $p \supset q$ 1
- (ii) 1. $\underline{\quad}$ \vdash $\underline{\quad}$ A
 2. $\Gamma, r \wedge s$ \vdash $r \wedge s$ 1
- (iii) 1. $\underline{\quad}$ \vdash $\underline{\quad}$ A
 2. $\neg q \vee r, \neg\neg p$ \vdash $\neg q \vee r$ 1
- (iv) 1. Γ \vdash $s \vee w$ premise
 2. $\underline{\quad}$ \vdash $\underline{\quad}$ premise
 3. Γ, Δ \vdash $(s \vee w) \wedge (p \supset q)$ 1,2, \wedge I
- (v) 1. Γ \vdash p premise
 2. $\underline{\quad}$ \vdash $\underline{\quad}$ 1, \vee I
 3. $\underline{\quad}$ \vdash $\underline{\quad}$ premise
 4. Γ, Δ \vdash $(p \vee q) \wedge \neg s$ 2,3, \wedge I
- (vi) 1. Γ \vdash $q \wedge r$ premise
 2. $\underline{\quad}$ \vdash $\underline{\quad}$ 1, \wedge E
 3. Γ \vdash $s \vee q$ 2, \vee I
- (vii) 1. Γ \vdash s premise
 2. Δ \vdash r premise
 3. Γ \vdash $\underline{\quad}$ 1, \vee I
 4. Γ, Δ \vdash $(s \vee w) \wedge r$ 2,3, \wedge I

- (viii) 1. Γ $\vdash s$ premise
2. Δ $\vdash r$ premise
3. $_$ $\vdash _$ 1, \vee I
4. $_$ $\vdash _$ 2, \vee I
5. Γ, Δ $\vdash (s \vee w) \wedge (\neg p \vee r)$ 3,4, \wedge I
- (ix) 1. Γ $\vdash \neg p$ premise
2. Γ, s $\vdash \neg p$ 1
3. $_$ $\vdash _$ 2, \supset I
- (x) 1. Γ $\vdash u \wedge w$ premise
2. $_$ $\vdash _$ 1, \wedge E
3. $_$ $\vdash _$ 2
4. Γ $\vdash s \supset u$ 3, \supset I
- (xi) 1. Γ $\vdash a \supset b$ premise
2. Δ $\vdash a$ premise
3. $_$ $\vdash _$ 1,2, \supset E
- (xii) 1. Γ $\vdash _$ premise
2. $_$ $\vdash x$ premise
3. Γ, Δ $\vdash y$ 1,2, \supset E
- (xiii) 1. Γ $\vdash \neg\neg p$ premise
2. $_$ $\vdash _$ 1, \neg E
- (xiv) 1. Δ $\vdash _$ premise
2. $_$ $\vdash s$ 1, \neg E

- (xv) 1. Γ, q $\vdash \neg(p \vee s)$ premise
2. Δ, q $\vdash p \vee s$ premise
3. $_$ $\vdash _$ 1,2, \neg I
- (xvi) 1. Γ, p $\vdash q \supset r$ premise
2. Δ, p $\vdash _$ premise
3. Γ, Δ $\vdash \neg p$ 1,2, \neg I
- (xvii) 1. $\Gamma, _$ $\vdash q \vee \neg r$ premise
2. $\Delta, _$ $\vdash _$ premise
3. Γ, Δ $\vdash \neg(s \wedge w)$ 1,2, \neg I
- (xviii) 1. Γ $\vdash q \vee r$ premise
2. Δ, q $\vdash p \supset s$ premise
3. Θ, r $\vdash p \supset s$ premise
4. $_$ $\vdash _$ 1,2,3, \vee E
- (xix) 1. Γ, p $\vdash w \wedge (p \supset q)$ premise
2. Δ $\vdash p \vee q$ premise
3. Θ, q $\vdash w \wedge (p \supset q)$ premise
4. $_$ $\vdash _$ 1,2, 3, \vee E
- (xx) 1. Γ $\vdash _$ premise
2. Δ, x $\vdash w$ premise
3. Θ, y $\vdash w$ premise
4. Γ, Δ, Θ $\vdash w$ 1,2,3, \vee E
- (xxi) 1. Γ $\vdash r \vee s$ premise
2. $\Delta, _$ $\vdash _$ premise
3. Θ, s $\vdash _$ premise
4. Γ, Δ, Θ $\vdash \neg(p \wedge q)$ 1,2,3, \vee E

3. The following have blanks that are impossible to fill in in accordance with our inference rules if we stick to the annotations. Explain why.

- (a) 1. $\underline{\quad}$ $\vdash r$ A
 2. p, q $\vdash p$ 1

.....

- (b) 1. r $\vdash r$ A
 2. $\underline{\quad}$ $\vdash \underline{\quad}$ 1
 3. r $\vdash p \supset q$ 2, \supset I

.....

- (c) 1. Γ $\vdash r$ premise
 2. s $\vdash s$ A
 3. s $\vdash \underline{\quad}$ 2, \vee I
 4. Γ, s $\vdash r \wedge (s \wedge q)$ 1,3, \wedge I

.....

- (d) 1. Γ $\vdash \neg\neg p$ premise
 2. $\underline{\quad}$ $\vdash \underline{\quad}$ 1, \neg E
 3. Δ $\vdash p \supset q$ premise
 4. Δ $\vdash q$ 2,3, \supset E

.....

- (e)
- | | | |
|-----------------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------|
| 1. Θ | $\vdash \underline{\quad}$ | premise |
| 2. Γ, p | $\vdash r$ | premise |
| 3. Δ, q | $\vdash r$ | premise |
| 4. Γ, Δ, Θ | $\vdash r$ | 1,2,3, \vee E |
| 5. Θ | $\vdash \underline{\quad}$ | 1, \wedge E |
-
-

- (f)
- | | | |
|--------------------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------|
| 1. Γ | $\vdash \underline{\quad}$ | premise |
| 2. Δ | $\vdash \underline{\quad}$ | premise |
| 3. Θ, p | $\vdash q$ | premise |
| 4. Γ, Δ, Θ | $\vdash \underline{\quad}$ | 1,2, \wedge I |
| 5. $\Gamma, \Delta, \Theta, p$ | $\vdash \underline{\quad}$ | 4 |
| 6. Γ, Δ, Θ | $\vdash \neg p$ | 3,5, \neg I |
-
-

- (g)
- | | | |
|-------------|----------------------------|-------------------|
| 1. Γ | $\vdash \neg\neg p$ | premise |
| 2. Γ | $\vdash \underline{\quad}$ | 1, \vee I |
| 3. Γ | $\vdash p \vee q$ | 2, \neg E |
-
-